http://journals.tubitak.gov.tr/math/
Research Article

Turk J Math
(2018) 42: $1795-1802$
© TÜBİTAK
doi:10.3906/mat-1707-9

# On the $J$-reflexive operators 

Parviz SADAT HOSSEINI* ${ }^{*}$, Bahmann YOUSEFI ${ }^{(1)}$<br>Department of Mathematics, Payame Noor University, Tehran, Iran

Received: 05.07.2017 • Accepted/Published Online: 28.03.2018 $\quad$ Final Version: 24.07 .2018


#### Abstract

A bounded linear operator $T$ on a Banach space $X$ is $J$-reflexive if every bounded operator on $X$ that leaves invariant the sets $J(T, x)$ for all $x$ is contained in the closure of $\operatorname{orb}(T)$ in the strong operator topology. We discuss some properties of $J$-reflexive operators. We also give and prove some necessary and sufficient conditions under which an operator is $J$-reflexive. We show that isomorphisms preserve $J$-reflexivity and some examples are considered. Finally, we extend the $J$-reflexive property in terms of subsets.


Key words: Orbit of an operator, $J$-sets, $J^{m i x}$-sets, $J$-class operator, reflexive operator

## 1. Introduction

One of the most challenging problems in operator theory is the "invariant subspace problem", which asks whether every operator on a Hilbert space (more generally, a Banach space) admits a nontrivial invariant subspace. Here, "operator" means "continuous linear transformation" and "invariant subspace" means "closed linear manifold such that the operator maps it to itself". A subspace is nontrivial if it is neither the zero subspace nor the whole space. An example constructed by Enflo [7] shows that for some Banach spaces there do exist operators with only trivial invariant subspaces. For a Hilbert space, however, the invariant subspace problem remains open. There is a deep connection between invariant subspaces of an operator and its reflexivity. Reflexive operators are those that can be identified by their nontrivial invariant subspaces and they have been studied for a few decades. For a good source on reflexivity, see [12] by Halmos. An operator $T$ is reflexive if any operator that leaves invariant, $T$-invariant subspaces belongs to the closure of $\{P(T): P$ is a polynomial $\}$ in the weak operator topology [12, 17]. In [11], the authors introduced orbit-reflexivity: an operator $T$ on a Hilbert space is orbit-reflexive if the only operators that leave invariant every norm closed $T$-invariant subset are contained in the closure of $\operatorname{orb}(T)$ in the strong operator topology. For example, compact operators, normal operators, contractions, and weighted shifts on the Hilbert spaces are orbit-reflexive [11]. Hadwin et al. in [10] also introduced and studied the notion of null-orbit reflexivity, which is a slight perturbation of the notion of orbit-reflexivity. The class of null-orbit reflexive operators includes the classes of hyponormal, algebraic, compact, strictly block-upper (lower) triangular operators, and operators whose spectral radius is not 1 . They also proved that every polynomially bounded operator on a Hilbert space is both orbit-reflexive and null-orbit reflexive. For further references on these topics, see [ $8-11,13,14]$.

[^0]
## SADAT HOSSEINI and YOUSEFI/Turk J Math

In this paper, our purpose is to characterize operators on Banach spaces that can be identified by their $J$-sets. First, we give some preliminaries that we need to give our results.

Let $X$ be a complex Banach space and denote by $B(X)$ the space of all bounded linear operators on $X$. For $T \in B(X)$, the set $\operatorname{orb}(T)=\left\{T^{n}: n \geq 0\right\}$ is called the orbit of $T$.

If $X$ is a separable Banach space and $\operatorname{orb}(T, x)=\left\{T^{n} x: n \geq 0\right\}$ is dense in $X$ for some $x$, then $T$ is called a hypercyclic operator and we call $x$ a hypercyclic vector.

The $J$-set of $T$ under $x, J(T, x)$, is defined by:

$$
J(T, x)=\{y: \text { there exists a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers }
$$

$\left(k_{n}\right)$ and a sequence $\left(x_{n}\right) \subset X$ such that $\left.x_{n} \rightarrow x, T^{k_{n}} x_{n} \rightarrow y\right\}$.
The set

$$
\begin{aligned}
& J^{m i x}(T, x)=\left\{y: \text { there exists a sequence }\left(x_{n}\right) \subset X \text { such that } x_{n} \rightarrow x\right. \text { and } \\
& \left.\qquad T^{n} x_{n} \rightarrow y\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

is called the $J^{\text {mix }}$-set of $T$ under $x$. The sets $J(T, x)$ and $J^{m i x}(T, x)$ are closed $T$-invariant subsets of $X$. If $T$ is invertible, then all $J$-sets are $T^{-1}$-invariant. For more details, see [6].

Recall that we say $T \in B(X)$ is power bounded with a power bound $M>0$ whenever $\left\|T^{n}\right\| \leq M$ for all positive integers $n$. In [6, Proposition 2.10] it was shown that if $T$ is power bounded we have the following:

$$
J(T, x)=\{y: \text { there exists a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers }
$$

$\left(k_{n}\right)$ such that $\left.T^{k_{n}} x \rightarrow y\right\}$.
An operator $T \in B(X)$ is called a $J$-class ( $J^{\text {mix }}$-class) operator if $J(T, x)=X\left(J^{m i x}(T, x)=X\right)$ for some $x \in X \backslash\{0\}$. The set of all $x \in X$ satisfying $J(T, x)=X\left(J^{m i x}(T, x)=X\right)$ is denoted by $A_{T}\left(A_{T}^{m i x}\right)$ and its elements are called the $J$-vectors ( $J^{m i x}$-vectors) for $T$. It is well known that $A_{T}$ is a closed subset of $X$ and $A_{T}^{m i x}$ is a closed subspace of $X$. We know that $T \in B(X)$ is hypercyclic if and only if $A_{T}=X$. For a good source on these topics we refer the reader to $[1,3-6,15,16,18]$.

Recall that $x \in X \backslash\{0\}$ is called a periodic point for $T \in B(X)$ if $T^{n} x=x$ for some positive integer $n$. The smallest such number $n$ is called the period of $x$.

## 2. Some properties of $J$-sets

Here we state and prove some properties of $J$-sets that will be used in the proof of our main results. The proof of the following lemma is straightforward and so we omit it.

Lemma 2.1 Suppose that $T \in B(X)$. Then for all $x, y \in X$ we have:
a) $J(T, x) \subseteq J(T, T x) \subseteq J\left(T, T^{2} x\right) \subseteq \cdots$,
b) $J^{m i x}(T, x) \subseteq J^{m i x}(T, T x) \subseteq J^{m i x}\left(T, T^{2} x\right) \subseteq \cdots$,
and equality holds if $T$ has a bounded inverse.
c) $J\left(T^{m}, x\right) \subseteq J(T, x)$ for all $m \in \mathbb{N}$.

Lemma 2.2 Suppose that $T \in B(X)$. We have:
(a) If $\left(T^{n}\right)_{n}$ is a Cauchy sequence and it has a subsequence that converges to a bounded operator $U$ in the
strong operator topology, then for every $x$, both sets $J(T, x)$ and $J^{m i x}(T, x)$ are equal to the singleton $\{U x\}$. (b) If $\left(T^{n}\right)_{n}$ converges to an operator $U$ in the strong operator topology, then

$$
2 J\left(T, x_{1}+x_{2}\right)-U\left(x_{1}+x_{2}\right) \subseteq J\left(T, x_{1}\right)+J\left(T, x_{2}\right)
$$

for all $x_{1}, x_{2} \in X$. The same result holds for $J^{m i x}$-sets.
Proof a) Note that $T$ is power bounded. Since for every $x \in X,\left(T^{n} x\right)_{n}$ is a Cauchy sequence that has a subsequence converging to $U x, T^{n} x \rightarrow U x$. Hence, $J^{m i x}(T, x)=J(T, x)=\{U x\}$.
b) Suppose that $y \in J\left(T, x_{1}+x_{2}\right)$. Then there exists a sequence $\left(w_{n}\right)_{n}$ in $X$ and a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers $\left(k_{n}\right)_{n}$ such that $w_{n} \rightarrow x_{1}+x_{2}$ and $T^{k_{n}} w_{n} \rightarrow y$. Now we have

$$
w_{n}-x_{1} \rightarrow x_{2}, \quad T^{k_{n}}\left(w_{n}-x_{1}\right) \rightarrow y-U x_{1}
$$

and

$$
w_{n}-x_{2} \rightarrow x_{1}, \quad T^{k_{n}}\left(w_{n}-x_{2}\right) \rightarrow y-U x_{2}
$$

Hence, we get

$$
y-U x_{1} \in J\left(T, x_{2}\right), \quad y-U x_{2} \in J\left(T, x_{1}\right)
$$

and so

$$
2 y-U\left(x_{1}+x_{2}\right) \in J\left(T, x_{1}\right)+J\left(T, x_{2}\right)
$$

which gives the result. Putting $k_{n}=n$, by the same method we conclude (b) for $J^{m i x}$-sets.
Recall that for $T \in B(X)$, by $\{T\}^{\prime}$ we mean the collection of all bounded operators on $X$, which commutes with $T$.

Lemma 2.3 Suppose that $T \in B(X)$ and $U \in\{T\}^{\prime}$. For all positive integers $m$ and $x \in X$, we have:
a) $U^{m}(J(T, x)) \subseteq J\left(T, U^{m} x\right)$,
b) $U^{m}\left(J^{m i x}(T, x)\right) \subseteq J^{m i x}\left(T, U^{m} x\right)$,
and equality holds if $U$ has a bounded inverse. Moreover, if $U$ is surjective, then $A_{T}$ is a $U$-invariant subset and $A_{T}^{m i x}$ is a $U$-invariant subspace of $X$.

Proof See Lemma 2.6 in [2] for parts (a) and (b). If U has a bounded inverse, then for $z \in J\left(T, U^{m} x\right)$, there exists a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers $\left(k_{n}\right)_{n}$ and a sequence $\left(u_{n}\right)_{n}$ in X such that $u_{n} \rightarrow U^{m} x$ and $T^{k_{n}} u_{n} \rightarrow z$. We therefore get

$$
U^{-m} u_{n} \rightarrow x, \quad T^{k_{n}}\left(U^{-m} u_{n}\right) \rightarrow U^{-m} z
$$

This yields that $U^{-m} z \in J(T, x)$ and hence $z \in U^{m}(J(T, x))$. Putting $k_{n}=n$, we can prove it for $J^{m i x}$-sets. Now if $x \in A_{T}$, then $J(T, x)=X$, and so we have

$$
X=U(X)=U(J(T, x)) \subseteq J(T, U x) \subseteq X
$$

Hence, $U\left(A_{T}\right) \subseteq A_{T}$. Similarly, we can prove that $A_{T}^{m i x}$ is a U-invariant subspace.
A simple consequence of Lemma 2.11 in [6] yields that if $x$ is a $J$-vector ( $J^{m i x}$-vector) for $T$, then for any nonzero scalar $\lambda, \lambda x$ is a $J$-vector $\left(J^{m i x}\right.$-vector) for $T$. If $A_{T}\left(A_{T}^{m i x}\right)$ is nonempty, then it is an infinite set.

## SADAT HOSSEINI and YOUSEFI/Turk J Math

## 3. On the property of $J$-reflexive operators

In this section, we first define the $J$-reflexive property, and then some properties of $J$-reflexive operators are investigated. We also state and prove necessary and sufficient conditions for an operator to be $J$-reflexive. Finally, we express $J$-reflexivity in terms of subsets. From now on, for simplicity, we denote the closure of a subset $A$ in the strong operator topology by $\bar{A}^{S O T}$.

Definition 3.1 We call $T \in B(X)$ a J-reflexive operator if every bounded operator that leaves invariant $J(T, x)$ (for all $x$ in $X$ ) is contained in the $\overline{\operatorname{orb}(T)}^{S O T}$. $J^{m i x}$-reflexivity can also be defined in a similar way.

It is clear that every $J$-reflexive operator on a Hilbert space is orbit-reflexive, but there exists an orbitreflexive operator that is not $J$-reflexive. See the following example.

Example 3.2 Suppose that $U$ is a bilateral shift on $l^{2}(\mathbb{Z})$, i.e. $U f(n)=f(n-1)$ where $f \in l^{2}(\mathbb{Z})$. Then $U$ is orbit-reflexive, since $U$ is a normal operator [11]. We know that $U^{-1} f(n)=f(n+1)$, so $U^{-1}$ does not belong to $\overline{\operatorname{orb}(U)}^{S O T}$. By Proposition 2.8 in [6], $U^{-1}$ leaves invariant $J$-sets of $U$, so $U$ is not $J$-reflexive.

It is easy to see that if $T \in B(X)$, and for all $x \in X, J(T, x)$ is an empty set or the whole space $X$ or the singleton $\{0\}$, then $T$ is not $J$-reflexive. For example, hypercyclic operators are not $J$-reflexive, since their $J$-sets are the whole space. However, the identity operator $I$ is the only bounded operator for which $J(I, x)=\{x\}$ for all $x$. Obviously, $I$ is $J$-reflexive.

Recall that if $T$ is an operator, then the set $\{\lambda \in \mathbb{C}: \lambda I-T$ is not invertible $\}$ is called the spectrum of $T$ and it is denoted by $\sigma(T)$. Now we investigate some properties of $J$-reflexive operators.

Theorem 3.3 Let $T \in B(X)$ be a $J$-reflexive operator. Then we have the following:
(a) If $T$ is invertible, then $\left(T^{n}\right)_{n}$ has a subsequence that converges to $I$ in the strong operator topology.
(b) If $T$ is not identity and $\left(T^{n}\right)_{n}$ is a Cauchy sequence, then $0 \in \sigma(T)$.
(c) If $T$ is not identity and is invertible, then $\left(T^{n}\right)_{n}$ diverges.

Proof a) Since by Proposition 2.8 in [6], $T^{-1}$ leaves invariant $J(T, x)$ for all $x$, by the hypothesis there exists a sequence $\left(n_{k}\right)_{k}$ of positive integers such that $T^{-1} x=\lim _{k} T^{n_{k}} x$ for all $x$. Thus, $T^{n_{k}+1} \rightarrow I$ in the strong operator topology.
b) On the contrary, suppose that $0 \notin \sigma(T)$, so $T$ is invertible, and by part (a), there exists a sequence of positive integers $\left(n_{k}\right)_{k}$ such that $T^{n_{k}} \rightarrow I$ in the strong operator topology. Since $\mathrm{B}(\mathrm{X})$ is a Banach space and $\left(T^{n}\right)_{n}$ is a Cauchy sequence, it follows that $T^{n} \rightarrow I$ in the strong operator topology. Similarly, since $T^{n_{k}+1} \rightarrow T$ in the strong operator topology, we have $T^{n} \rightarrow T$ in the strong operator topology and so $T=I$, which is a contradiction.
c) If $\left(T^{n}\right)_{n}$ converges, then by part (b), $0 \in \sigma(T)$, which is a contradiction.

Lemma 3.4 If $T \in B(X)$ is a $J$-reflexive operator, then $\|T\| \geq 1$.
Proof Suppose that $\|T\|<1$. Then, since $\left\|T^{n} x\right\| \leq\|T\|^{n}\|x\|$, we have

$$
J^{m i x}(T, x)=J(T, x)=\{0\}
$$

for all $x$. Hence, $T$ can not be $J$-reflexive, which is a contradiction.

## SADAT HOSSEINI and YOUSEFI/Turk J Math

Isomorphisms preserve the $J$-reflexive property, as follows.

Theorem 3.5 Suppose that $X$ and $Y$ are Banach spaces and $S: X \rightarrow Y$ is an isomorphism. If $T$ is a $J$-reflexive operator on $X$, then $S T S^{-1}$ is also a $J$-reflexive operator on $Y$.

Proof First, we show that $J\left(S T S^{-1}, y\right)=S\left(J\left(T, S^{-1} y\right)\right)$. Note that since $S$ is an isomorphism, $S$ and $S^{-1}$ are bounded. If $z \in J\left(S T S^{-1}, y\right)$, then there exist $\left(y_{n}\right)_{n}$ in $Y$ and a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers $\left(k_{n}\right)_{n}$ such that $y_{n} \rightarrow y$ and $\lim _{n} S T^{k_{n}} S^{-1} y_{n}=z$. Since $S^{-1} y_{n} \rightarrow S^{-1} y$, we get $S^{-1} z \in J\left(T, S^{-1} y\right)$ and so $z \in S\left(J\left(T, S^{-1} y\right)\right)$. Thus,

$$
J\left(S T S^{-1}, y\right) \subseteq S\left(J\left(T, S^{-1} y\right)\right)
$$

Conversely, if $z \in S\left(J\left(T, S^{-1} y\right)\right)$, then there exist $x \in X,\left(u_{n}\right)_{n} \subseteq X$, and a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers $\left(k_{n}\right)_{n}$ such that

$$
z=S x, u_{n} \rightarrow S^{-1} y \text { and } \lim _{n} T^{k_{n}} u_{n}=x
$$

Putting $v_{n}=S u_{n}$, then $v_{n} \rightarrow y$ and we have

$$
z=S x=\lim _{n} S T^{k_{n}} S^{-1} v_{n}
$$

Hence, $z \in J\left(S T S^{-1}, y\right)$. Now if $W \in B(Y)$ leaves invariant the sets $J\left(S T S^{-1}, y\right)$, then for all $y \in Y$, we have

$$
W S\left(J\left(T, S^{-1} y\right)\right) \subseteq S\left(J\left(T, S^{-1} y\right)\right)
$$

Therefore, we get

$$
S^{-1} W S\left(J\left(T, S^{-1} y\right)\right) \subseteq J\left(T, S^{-1} y\right)
$$

By the $J$-reflexivity of $T$, there exists a sequence $\left(n_{k}\right)_{k}$ of positive integers such that

$$
S^{-1} W S x=\lim _{k} T^{n_{k}} x
$$

for all $x \in X$. Putting $u=S x$, we have

$$
W u=\lim _{k}\left(S T S^{-1}\right)^{n_{k}} u
$$

for all $u \in Y$ and the proof is complete.
In the following theorem, the sufficient conditions for the $J$-reflexivity of an operator are given.

Theorem 3.6 Let $T \in B(X)$. If $T$ satisfies one of the following statements, then $T$ is $J$-reflexive:
a) $T$ is a power bounded operator that has no periodic point and $x \in J(T, x)$ for all $x \in X$.
b) $T$ is power bounded and invertible, and there exists $m \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $T^{m} x \in J(T, x)$ for all $x \in X$.
c) $T$ is invertible and there exists positive integer $m$ such that $T^{m}=I$.

Proof Let $T$ satisfy in (a) and suppose on the contrary that $T$ is not $J$-reflexive. Then there exists an operator $S \in B(X) \backslash \overline{\operatorname{orb}(T)}^{S O T}$ such that

$$
S(J(T, x)) \subseteq J(T, x)
$$

## SADAT HOSSEINI and YOUSEFI/Turk J Math

for all $x \in X$. Therefore, there exist $x_{0} \in X$ and $\delta>0$ such that $B\left(S x_{0} ; \delta\right) \cap \operatorname{orb}\left(T, x_{0}\right)$ is a finite set. Since $x_{0} \in J\left(T, x_{0}\right), S x_{0} \in J\left(T, x_{0}\right)$, and this means that there exists a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers $\left(k_{n}\right)_{n}$ such that

$$
S x_{0}=\lim _{n} T^{k_{n}} x_{0} .
$$

This is possible only if $x_{0}$ is a periodic point for $T$, which is a contradiction. Now suppose that (b) holds. Let $W \in B(X)$ be such that $W(J(T, x)) \subseteq J(T, x)$ for all $x$. The surjectivity of T yields the surjectivity of $T^{m}$ and therefore for every $z \in X$ there exists $x \in X$ such that $z=T^{m} x$. Since for all $x, T^{m} x \in J(T, x)$, we have $W\left(T^{m} x\right) \in J(T, x)$ and therefore there exists a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers $\left(k_{n}\right)_{n}$ such that

$$
W z=W\left(T^{m} x\right)=\lim _{n} T^{k_{n}} x=\lim _{n} T^{k_{n}-m} z
$$

Thus, $W \in \overline{\operatorname{orb}(T)}^{S O T}$ and T is $J$-reflexive. Finally, assume that (c) holds. Since $T^{m}=I$, $\operatorname{orb}(T)$ is a finite set and therefore $T$ is power bounded. On the other hand, for all $x, T x \in J\left(T^{m}, T x\right)$, and then by Lemma 2.1 (c), $T x \in J(T, T x)$. Eventually, Lemma 2.1 (a) (equality holds) yields that $T x \in J(T, x)$. Now by using (b), we get the desired result.

Recall that the space of convergent sequences is usually denoted by $c$. This is a Banach space over $\mathbb{C}$ or $\mathbb{R}$ under the supremum norm.

Example 3.7 Define $T: c \rightarrow c$ by

$$
T\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}, \cdots\right)=\left(x_{2}, x_{1}, x_{3}, \cdots\right) .
$$

Clearly $T$ is invertible, and $\|T\|=1$. Since for any $x \in X$ and all $n \in \mathbb{N}$ we have $T^{2 n+1} x=T x$, thus $\left(T^{2}\right)^{n}(T x)=T x$ and so $T x \in J\left(T^{2}, x\right)$. Now $T x \in J(T, x)$ by Lemma 2.1 (c). Indeed, $J(T, x)=\{x, T x\}$ for all $x$. Hence, $T$ is $J$-reflexive by Theorem 3.6 (b).

Example 3.8 Let $p(A)$ be a permutation $p$ on a finite set $A$. Define $S_{i j}$ on $c$ by

$$
S_{i j}\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, \cdots\right)=\left(x_{1}, \cdots, x_{i-1}, p\left\{x_{i}, \cdots, x_{j}\right\}, x_{j+1}, \cdots\right) .
$$

If $m$ is the smallest positive integer satisfying $p^{m+1}=p$, then $S_{i j}^{m+1} x=S_{i j} x$. Thus, $S_{i j} x \in J\left(S_{i j}^{m}, x\right)$ and by Lemma 2.1 (c), $S_{i j} x \in J\left(S_{i j}, x\right)$. Indeed,

$$
J\left(S_{i j}, x\right)=\left\{x, S_{i j} x, \cdots, S_{i j}^{m-1} x\right\}
$$

Now by Theorem 3.6 (b), it follows that $S_{i j}$ is J-reflexive.
Example 3.9 Let $H$ be a real Hilbert space and $\Lambda: B(H) \rightarrow B(H)$ be defined by $\Lambda(T)=T^{*}$. Then $\Lambda^{2}=I$ and $\Lambda$ is $J$-reflexive by Theorem 3.6 (c).

Next we present some examples of $J$-reflexive and non- $J$-reflexive operators on finite dimensional spaces.
Example 3.10 Let $T$ be defined on the space of complex $n \times n$ matrices by $T(A)=A^{t}$ where $A^{t}$ is the transpose of $A$. Since $T^{2}=I, T$ is $J$-reflexive by Theorem 3.6 (c).

Example 3.11 Suppose that $\operatorname{dim} X=1$ and $T$ is defined on $X$ by $T x=(1 / 2) x$. Then $\|T\|<1$, and by Lemma 3.4, it follows that $T$ is not $J$-reflexive.

The concept of $J$-reflexivity can be expressed in terms of subsets as follows.
Definition 3.12 Let $T$ be a bounded linear operator on a Banach space $X$ and $M$ be a subset of $X$. We call $T M-J$-reflexive if every $W \in B(X)$ that leaves invariant $J(T, x)$ for all $x$ in $M$ is contained in $\overline{\text { orb }}(T)^{\text {SOT. }}$. $M-J^{m i x}$-reflexivity can also be defined in a similar way.

It is clear that $M$ - $J$-reflexivity implies $J$-reflexivity. The converse is true for power bounded operators and dense subsets.

Theorem 3.13 If $T \in B(X)$ is $J$-reflexive and power bounded and $M$ is a dense subset of $X$, then $T$ is $M-J$-reflexive.

Proof Assume that $W \in B(X)$ leaves invariant $J(T, z)$ for all $z \in M$. It is enough to show that $W$ leaves invariant $J(T, x)$ for all $x \in X$. Suppose that $x \in X$ and $y \in J(T, x)$. Then there exists a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers $\left(k_{n}\right)_{n}$ such that $y=\lim _{n} T^{k_{n}} x$. By density of $M$, we can find sequences $\left(x_{n}\right)_{n}$ and $\left(y_{n}\right)_{n}$ in $M$ such that $x_{n} \rightarrow x$ and $y_{n} \rightarrow y$. Thus, for every $\epsilon>0$, there exists $N \in \mathbb{N}$ such that for all $n \geq N$, we have

$$
\left\|x_{n}-x\right\|<\epsilon / 3 L,\left\|y_{n}-y\right\|<\epsilon / 3,\left\|y-T^{k_{n}} x\right\|<\epsilon / 3
$$

, where $L$ is a power bound of $T$. Now for $m, n \geq N$, we get

$$
\left\|y_{m}-T^{k_{n}} x_{m}\right\| \leq\left\|y_{m}-y\right\|+\left\|y-T^{k_{n}} x\right\|+\left\|T^{k_{n}}\right\|\left\|x-x_{m}\right\|<\epsilon
$$

Thus, $y_{m} \in J\left(T, x_{m}\right)$ and therefore $W y_{m} \in J\left(T, x_{m}\right)$ for $m \geq N$. Since $W y_{m}$ tends to $W y$, by applying the same method that has been used in the proof of Lemma 2.5 in [5], we obtain that $W y \in J(T, x)$. This completes the proof.

## References

[1] Ayadi A, Marzougui H. $J$-class abelian semigroups of matrices on $\mathbb{C}^{n}$ and hypercyclicity. RACSAM Rev R Acad A 2014; 108: 557-566.
[2] Azimi MR. J-class sequences of linear operators. Complex Anal Oper Th 2018; 12: 293-303.
[3] Azimi MR, Müler V. A note on $J$-sets of linear operators. RACSAM Rev R Acad A 2011; 105: 449-453.
[4] Bayart F, Matheron É. Dynamics of Linear Operators. New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
[5] Costakis G, Manoussos A. $J$-class weighted shifts on the space of bounded sequences of complex numbers. Integr Equat Oper Th 2008; 62: 149-158.
[6] Costakis G, Manoussos A. J-class operators and hypercyclicity. J Operat Theor 2012; 67: 101-119.
[7] Enflo P. On the invariant subspace problem for Banach spaces. Acta Math-Djursholm 1987; 158: 213-313.
[8] Esterle J. Operators of Read's type are not orbit-reflexive. Integr Equat Oper Th 2009; 63: 591-593.
[9] Hadwin D, Ionascu I, McHugh M, Yousefi H. $\mathbb{C}$-orbit reflexive operators. Oper Matrices 2011; 5: 511-527.
[10] Hadwin D, Ionascu I, Yousefi H. Null-orbit reflexive operators. Oper Matrices 2012; 6: 567-576.
[11] Hadwin D, Nordgren E, Radjavi H, Rosenthal P. Orbit-reflexive operators. J Lond Math Soc 1986; 34: 111-119.
[12] Halmos PR. Invariant subspaces. In: Butzer PL, Szökefalvi-Nagy B, editors. Abstract Spaces and Approximation Proceedings of the Conference; 18-27 July 1968; Mathematical Research Institute of Oberwolfach, Germany. Basel, Switzerland: Birkhäuser, 1969, pp. 26-30.
[13] McHugh M. Orbit-reflexivity. PhD, University of New Hampshire, Durham, NH, USA, 1995.
[14] Müller V, Vrsovsky L. On orbit reflexive operators. J Lond Math Soc 2009; 79: 497-510.
[15] Nasseri AB. J-class operators on certain Banach spaces. PhD, Technical University of Dortmund, Dortmund, Germany, 2013.
[16] Nasseri AB. Operators on $l^{\infty}$ with totally disconnected spectrum and applications to $J$-class operators. J Math Anal Appl 2014; 410: 94-100.
[17] Radjavi H, Rosenthal P. Invariant Subspaces. New York, NY, USA: Springer-Verlag, 1973.
[18] Tian G, Hou BN. Limits of $J$-class operators. P Am Math Soc 2014; 142: 1663-1667.


[^0]:    *Correspondence: psadath@farspnu.ac.ir
    2010 AMS Mathematics Subject Classification: Primary 47A65; Secondary 47B99

